

Original Research Article

The role of Participatory Learning and Action on strengthening the different domains of empowerment on self-medication with antimicrobials in Nyalenda Informal Settlement, Kisumu County, Kenya

Abstract

Introduction: Self-medication with antimicrobials (SMWA) is a common global practice. Studies in Nyalenda B Ward, an informal settlement in western Kenya, found significant households (76.6%) perceived the practice of SMWA as convenient and appropriate. The rationale of the current study was in response to unsolved self-medication practice through Functional Health literacy in such set-ups.

Aims: This study used Participatory Learning and Action (PLA) as a tool and assessed its role on strengthening the different domains of empowerment on SMWA. Data was collected from 1531 PLA trainees through focused group discussions and structured questionnaires. Results revealed that the reasons for SMWA are ignorance and easier accessibility.

Study design: The study was carried out in Nyalenda B Ward, a sub-location in Nyalenda informal settlement within western Kenya. Nyalenda is the second-largest informal settlement in Kisumu, after Manyatta, and is situated to the south of the Kisumu city

The study adopted a descriptive survey design and the data was collected through a structured questionnaire and focused group discussions (FGDs).

Results: Logistic regression analyses to establish the association between PLA domains and all empowerment domains, revealed that flexible learning and listening increase power within by 5 times (OR=5.361, 95%CI=3.101-9.268, $P<0.0001$), power with by 6 times (OR=6.160, 95%CI=3.437-11.39, $P<0.00010$) and power over by 2 times (OR=2.261, 95%CI=1.293-3.954, $P<0.0001$). Participatory evaluation may increase power within by almost 8 times (OR=7.711, 95%CI=5.184-11.459, $P<0.0001$), power with by 5 times (OR=5.012, 95%CI=3.375-7.443, $P<0.0001$), and power over by more than 3 times (OR=3.618, 95%CI=2,375-5,509, $P<0.0001$). Participatory interaction may increase power within by almost 8 times (OR=7.823, 95%CI=4.798-12.763, $P<0.0001$), power with by over 8 times (OR=8.610, 95%CI=4.987-14.866, $P<0.0001$), power over by 4 times (OR=4.003, 95%CI=2.325-6.693, $P<0.0001$).

32

33 **Conclusion:** It is concluded that PLA on SMWA may increase the community empowerment
34 with knowledge and skills of SMWA with a magnitude of 8 but the ability to negotiate their
35 inclusion in the health system may increase with a comparative lower strength of 2 times.

36 **Keywords:** Self-medication with antimicrobials; participatory learning and action; community
37 empowerment.

38 INTRODUCTION

39 Self-medication is the obtaining and consumption of a drug without the advice of physician
40 either for diagnosis, prescription or surveillance of treatment (Montastruc, Bagheri, Geraud, &
41 Lapeyre-Mestre, 1997) or the use of medication by a patient on his own initiative or on the
42 advice of a pharmacist or a lay person instead of consulting a medical practitioner (WHO, 2000).
43 The practice can readily relieve acute medical problems, save time spent in waiting to see a
44 doctor, save life in a cute condition and may contribute to decreased healthcare cost (Hughes,
45 McElnay, & Fleming, 2001), however, it may result in wasting of resources, increase in
46 pathogens resistance, drug interactions, adverse drug reactions, prolonged suffering and drug
47 dependence. The practice has the potential of harming society at large as well as the individual
48 patient (WHO, 2001).

49

50 The prevalence of self-medication with antibiotic ranges from 48% in Saudi Arabia to 78% in
51 Yemen and Uzbekistan (Belkina Tatyana, 2014), in Sudan, Khartoum State 73.9% (Awad,
52 Eltayeb, Matowe, & Thalib, 2005), in Kenya within Nyalenda B Sub Location is at 76.9% of the
53 households (Owour, 2015) while in Ethiopia it is low (14.5%). Laws and policies are in place to
54 manage antibiotics, but the Kenya government regulation is neither effective nor enforced. The
55 positive attributes of self-medication are shared among the patients, healthcare professionals, the
56 healthcare system and the pharmaceutical industry but the patient and the community meets the
57 risk because they have inadequate or lack of knowledge and understanding of the risks associated
58 with self-medication. It has been established that the communities that are neither empowered
59 with knowledge and skills of self-medication with antimicrobials nor ability to negotiate their
60 inclusion in the health system are prone to SMWA (Nasir, 2012; Ocan et al., 2014; Okeke et al.,
61 2005) expanding access to such social entitlements will facilitate the reduction of the level of

62 self-medication with antimicrobials and promote perceptions with an experiential value therefore
63 enhancing rationale use of antimicrobials and minimizing risk.

64 The rationale of the current study was developed in response to unsolved issues in self-
65 medication with antimicrobials, especially in informal settlements. The conventional approaches
66 to controlling self-medication with antimicrobials are less effective and have not yielded the
67 desired result in the affected regions. The study realizes the importance of identifying where the
68 problem lies by accessing the tacit knowledge, which varies across people, communities and
69 areas and it is often specific to locality, age, gender and class. Such knowledge is contextual and
70 includes answers to many questions, augments problem solving abilities of both local
71 communities and the researcher and helps in probing relational linkages between issues and
72 causal forces from different dimensions. The study also recognizes the fact that there are
73 multiple perspectives of primary stakeholders of self-medication with antimicrobials.
74 Appreciating such multiple perspectives is crucial in determining the priorities and preferences
75 of the primary stakeholders. This study therefore embraced the issue of human development and
76 community involvement or ownership for the purpose of sustaining this intervention. Given the
77 need to control self-medication with antibiotics ‘from the ground up’, the perspectives of the
78 community, must become a normative part of self-medication research. The PLA is a powerful,
79 practical ‘fit-for-purpose’ methodology for achieving this since it enables groups to engage
80 meaningfully and contribute with ease to academic research.

81

82 A community mobilization using empowerment model as a strategy can be implemented through
83 Participatory Learning and Action (PLA) as a tool. (Kabeer, 2003) refers to empowerment as the
84 processes by which those who have been denied the ability to make choice acquire such ability.
85 There must have been the ability to have chosen differently and if the alternative does exist for
86 you. The concept of empowerment exists in three dimensions: The resource dimension which
87 includes, economic, human, social, political and cultural resources that serves to enhance the
88 ability to exercise choice. The agency dimension which is the ability to define one's goals and act
89 upon them. The achievement dimension that refers to the extent to which this potential is
90 achieved or fails to be achieved in relationship to the outcomes of people’s efforts.

91

92 Insights from gender theory into the empowerment debate have increased clarity over the
93 concept and operation of power, most notably that power is about more than just ‘power over’
94 people and resources. Previous literature (Rowlands, 1997) categorizes four types of power
95 relations to stress the difference between power over (ability to influence and coerce) and power
96 to (organize and change existing hierarchies), power with (power from collective action) and
97 power within (power from individual consciousness). At present, much of the focus of both
98 community participation and empowerment is placed on participatory approaches. Participatory
99 Learning and Action is another variation of Participatory Action Research that began in rural
100 development research. The theory and practice of PLA (Chambers, 1997), recognizes the ability
101 of the non or poorly educated people to make and carry out rational and successful decisions and
102 actions that were formerly the responsibility of experts, allows innovation to be spread by peer
103 groups not only by professionals and brings about a role reversal where local people become
104 colleagues of professionals, thereby generating a change in attitudes and behaviors of the
105 professionals. Using visualizations, PLA has been used in a wide range of situations for
106 supporting empowerment goals, through role plays and draw and write techniques as the basis
107 for generating information (Susan, 2001). It is an approach for learning and organizing local
108 communities and groups for interacting with them, understanding them and learning from them.
109 It helps in initiating a participatory process, in sustaining it and in opening up vistas of avenues
110 for participation. It enables the local people to express, enhance, share and analyze their
111 knowledge of life and condition and to plan and act. It is a means of understanding and
112 facilitating and evoking their participation and also opening ways to which such groups can
113 participate in decision making, project design, planning, execution and monitoring (Melzack,
114 1973; Mukherjee, 2001).

115
116 It is upon this background that we conducted a study to establish the role of Participatory
117 Learning and Action (PLA) on strengthening the different domains of empowerment on self-
118 medication with antimicrobials in Nyalenda informal settlement, within Kisumu County, Kenya.

119
120

121 **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

122 *Study area.* The study was carried out in Nyalenda B Ward, a sub-location in Nyalenda informal
123 settlement within western Kenya. Nyalenda is the second-largest informal settlement in Kisumu,
124 after Manyatta, and is situated to the south of the Kisumu city. Nyalenda is on latitude -.1267 and
125 longitude 34.7575. The area is bound by Ring Road to the North and marshlands to the South
126 and consists of two separate settlements or Sub-Locations, Nyalenda A and B. Nyalenda B
127 features five smaller units (Kilo, Got Owak, Dunga, Nanga and Western), that occupy an area of
128 4.7 km².Nyalenda B Sub-Location has a population of approximately of 32,430, out of which
129 16,189 are males and 16,241 are females distributed in a total of 8,561 households (KIHBS,
130 2005/06).

131
132 *Study design and population.* The study adopted a descriptive survey design and the data was
133 collected through structured questionnaire and focused group discussions (FGDs). The study
134 purposively picked 30 CHVs that were trained on PLA on self-medication with antimicrobials
135 (SMWA) as peer trainers. The PLA workshop on SMWA was conducted followed by 150 PLA
136 open learning sessions for 1501 households. This was facilitated by the trained CHVs. The
137 households open learning sessions was conducted within 2 weeks concurrently. Each trained
138 CHV facilitated 5 open learning sessions composed of 10 households and administered a
139 questionnaire for each individual at the end of each session. Prior to the conduct of The Team’s
140 PLA workshop, a planning meeting was held by the researcher, the Community Health
141 Extension Officer (CHEW), County community focal person, Sub-County community focal
142 person and selected community representatives to prepare the actual conduct of the discussions.
143 Members discussed and agreed on the date and the mode of CHVs invitation. Discussions for
144 this study was held in collaboration with the Nyalenda Health Centre.

145
146 **CHVs PLA workshop**

147 On the day of the CHV PLA workshop, team introductions and community representation were
148 done. Explanations of PLA technique and its principles were provided. Self-medication with
149 antimicrobials problem statement was explained. Illiterate participants were to ask their group
150 members to help write down their ideas. The CHV PLA workshop randomly formed 6 break-out
151 groups. Participants were asked to first take part in their group with interest. Each group

152 nominated a group facilitator together with a note-taker. Groups ran concurrently and each group
153 discussion session lasted about 2 hours. Groups recorded notes on cards and flipcharts and
154 presented at the end of the session. During feedback, an opportunity was given to the participants
155 to further elaborate any of their ideas, or clarify any idea they felt had not been captured in
156 perspective. Data synthesis following CHV PLA workshop was done on the second day. Note-
157 takers first presented the outcome of their group discussions followed by brief feedback or
158 further input from the wider group. Finally, after all group presentations and feedback,
159 participants were asked to evaluate whether their expectations had been met. From group work,
160 issues identified by participants as major root causes of SMWA, their proposed actions towards
161 its elimination, the process towards achievement of the desired actions as well as the
162 responsibility of stakeholders were presented.

163
164 Each group ranked the most important root causes of self-medication with antimicrobials by
165 rearranging the causes in order of "changeability", from most changeable to least changeable and
166 identification of potential strategies for addressing root causes of SMWA. The team then formed
167 one major group and used index cards for direct ranking. Index cards bearing similar
168 concerns/ideas were grouped together and tallied. This was followed by data interpretation.

169
170 **PLA meetings at the household level**

171 This was conducted summarily because of the household representatives' impatience. Every
172 group of 10 household representatives was taken through SMWA problem statement and
173 problem analysis using the problem tree, identification of root causes, identification of most
174 important root causes and identification of possible solutions to the problem. Objective analysis,
175 identification of root causes that are both important and changeable and ranking potential
176 strategies to address root causes (important and changeable) of self-medication was not done at
177 the household level because of limited time. On a later date, the trained CHVs and the researcher
178 had an open discussion and ranked the households most important root causes of SMWA, the
179 potential strategies for addressing them, and identification of barriers to the progress of SMWA
180 control.

181

182 To mitigate for the barriers or to implement structural intervention, the study gave a feedback
183 report to the local community health facility management on their findings.

184 The researcher, the CHEW for the Nyalenda B CHVs and the health management representatives
185 then organized for a conflict management meeting. The CHVs encouraged themselves to
186 continue with the household health promotion and especially community mobilization on self-
187 medication with antimicrobials with a general aim to conduct an Integrated Health Outreach
188 services.

189 **Data collection procedures**

190 During PLA, data was collected by the nominated note-takers for every group. Groups recorded
191 notes on cards and flipcharts and presented at the end of the session. Structured questionnaires
192 for the assessment of PLA and empowerment was then administered to all the trainees at the end
193 of PLA. The CHVs received training on data collection, key components of the study, including
194 the objective, detailed content of the questionnaire, and its administration in a way that protected
195 the identity and privacy of the respondents. The questionnaire was pre-tested in a sub-section of
196 the CHVs (whose data was not included in the final analyses) and necessary corrections were
197 made on questions that were not clear. The questionnaire contained closed-ended questions on
198 socio-demographic characteristics of the trainees and questions in a Likert scale of 4 for
199 evaluation of all domains of PLA and Empowerment. This study developed a Participatory
200 Learning and Action and Empowerment Evaluation (PLAEE) tool (See Supplementary Data File
201 I) that had the type of questions used for measuring the level of all the PLA and empowerment
202 domains and the measurement procedure. This tool was developed by adopting relevant ideas
203 from Growth and Empowerment Measure (GEM) survey (Haswell, 2010), the Trocaire
204 awareness index tool (Trocaire, 2012), a Community Ownership and Preparedness Index (COPI)
205 tool (Thomas, 2011), and a summative evaluation type tool (Tyler, 1974). Studies that measured
206 the level of PLA and empowerment (Vassall et al., 2014) and those based on participants
207 perceptions and valuation using *etic* and *emic* criteria and analysis (O'Reilly-de Brún, 2016)
208 were reviewed. Finally, theoretical literature on PLA and empowerment was reviewed. The
209 Growth and Empowerment Measure (GEM) survey tool comprised of a 14-item Empowerment
210 Scale. The GEM was developed as a tool to measure the process and outcomes of empowerment
211 interventions such as Family Wellbeing (FWB). The GEM gave some of the measurable
212 characteristic of empowerment like self-capacity, inner peace, strength, happiness and

213 connectedness. This was assessed using questions in a Likert scale. The Trocaire awareness
214 index tool was used for assessing the effectiveness of empowerment by asking questions on
215 awareness of rights, knowledge and duties. A Community Ownership and Preparedness Index
216 (COPI) tool and a Behavioral Tracking Survey (BTS) were carried out to assess the levels of
217 preparedness of the CBOs and their members and to determine the strength of community
218 mobilization. BTS used an interview tool with coded questions on behaviors and perceptions
219 concerning participation in group activities, beliefs about collective action, safe sex practices and
220 STI treatment seeking. A summative evaluation type assessed the worth of the workshop
221 activities (Tyler, 1974). The reliability analysis was done for the tool and the Cronbach's Alpha
222 of 0.894 was recorded. PLA and empowerment theoretical literature identified PLA domains as
223 flexible learning and listening, participatory evaluation, participatory interaction and
224 empowerment domains as power within (Increased awareness and desire to change), power with
225 (Increased solidarity to challenge underlying assumptions), and power over (changes in
226 underlying resources and power to challenge constraints).
227 The PLAAE (See Supplementary Data File I) tool contained questions for PLA (for each
228 domain) and empowerment (for each domain) assessment in a Likert scale of 4 and they were
229 coded as 1= Very good, 2=Good, 3=Somehow, and 4=No. Each variable (domain) was assessed
230 using 3 or more questions.

231 **Statistical Analysis**

232 All statistical analyses were carried out using the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS,
233 version 24) software. The coded and cleaned data were used to calculate frequencies and
234 proportions of the socio-demographic characteristics of the 1531 PLA trainees and responses on
235 PLA and empowerment questions. The mean of all the questions for every domain of PLA and
236 empowerment was calculated and their corresponding frequencies established to determine the
237 value coded to a domain for all the 1531 PLA trainees.

238 To establish the level of each domain of empowerment and PLA and to know whether there is
239 PLA and empowerment achieved or not for every trainee, a Likert scale code was recorded.
240 'Very good' and 'good' was equated to *Yes* taking up the mean value of 1 through 2.
241 'Somehow' and 'No' was equated to *No* taking up the mean values of 2.01 through 4. Then the
242 percentage frequencies of *Yes* and *No* was calculated for all the domains of empowerment and

243 PLA. *Yes* is empowerment and PLA and *No* is no empowerment achieved and PLA not
244 effectively conducted. The 1531 trainees existed as 30 groups of 50 households except for 1
245 group that had 51 households and 1 group of 30 CHVs. Chi-square analysis was used to
246 establish the groups for every category of socio demographic characteristics that were highly
247 empowered through PLA and to verify the association between PLA domains and empowerment
248 variables. Odd Ratio, 95% CI and p-values for each PLA domain were obtained using binary
249 logistic regression for each empowerment. For all analyses, $P \leq 0.05$ was considered statistically
250 significant.

251 **RESULTS**

252 **The socio-demographic characteristics of the CHVs and all the 1531 PLA trainees (trained** 253 **CHVs inclusive)**

254 A total of 1531 Nyalenda B community members were purposively chosen and went through
255 PLA (CHVs inclusive) on SMWA, responded to the questions on empowerment and PLA
256 assessment. Table 1 presents the socio-demographic characteristics of the study participants.

257 Based on the data the community members aged between 26-35 years developed power with
258 more significantly relative to the rest of the age categories (48.3%; $P=0.008$), the females
259 developed power within more significantly as compared to the males (79.0%; $P<0.0001$) and the
260 mother, in comparison to other family members, developed all categories of empowerment
261 significantly (power within 68.9%; $P=0.002$, power with 68.2%; $P<0.0001$, power over 70.3%;
262 $P<0.0001$). Furthermore the community members with secondary level of education were more
263 significantly empowered in all categories in comparison to other levels of education (power
264 within 35.0%; $P=0.025$, power with 34.2%; $P<0.0001$, power over 34.2%; $P<0.0001$) and the
265 self-employed developed power with more significantly than others in their respective categories
266 (52.5%; $P=0.002$). Likewise those that had an average income of less than Ksh 5000 developed
267 power with significantly (70.0%; $P=0.02$) and those that spent less than Ksh500 on purchasing
268 drugs developed power with and power over significantly (power within 64.7%; $P=0.008$, power
269 over 64.3%; $P=0.025$) in comparison to the relevant categories. Finally the Christian protestant
270 significantly developed power over (43.9%; $P<0.0001$) and caretakers of children below 12 years
271 developed all categories of empowerment with a significance (power within 37.7%; $P=0.018$,

272 power with 38.5%; $P < 0.0001$, power over 39.2%; $P = 0.007$) as compared to other relevant
273 categories.

274 **PLA conduct**

275 The trainer highlighted self-medication with the antimicrobial problem statement and allowed
276 the team to discuss it freely. All the 100% members were not aware that buying medicine from a
277 pharmacy without a prescription is self-medication 76.7% assumed headache is malaria, 80%
278 indicated that any pain in the chest after a cold period is pneumonia, 83.3% agreed that after
279 taking antimalarials and the headache persists then typhoid should be managed, 53.3% agreed
280 that *Mara Moja* or *Sona Moja* treats malaria and 60% said amoxicillin and cotrimoxazole were
281 good for management of common cold. 100% of the members had used self-medication for
282 themselves or their family members in the last 3 months. The team was then trained on the effect
283 of SMWA to the individual and to the community by highlighting the nature and the effect of
284 antimicrobials' prolonged use, over dosages, under dosages, reuse, misuse, and missed diagnosis.

285
286 The team was given the opportunity to ask questions and to add their views. One of the team
287 members said, "*It is advertised through the radio that we use Mara Moja for severe headache*
288 *and it controls my headache and when the headache keeps on recurring then I consult with the*
289 *pharmacy. Another member interjects, "Normally that is just malaria and in my case I just buy*
290 *AL"* and yet another one said, "*and when it continues then it is typhoid"*. Another member said,
291 "*Amoxyl works best for me when I get a common cold"*. There were similar statements from
292 some members. Such statements were freely discussed and a consensus obtained.

293 The team was then split into 6 FGD groups and each group identified the chain of events that
294 leads to self-medication with antimicrobials, most important root causes, and solutions to
295 SMWA. Direct ranking of the most important root causes (they were encouraged to have
296 "changeability" in mind, from most changeable to least changeable) and potential strategies
297 addressing the root causes of SMWA was done. It was established through FGD that reasons for
298 SMWA are ignorance, high cost of prescription medicine, unavailability of time, distance from
299 preferred the health facilities, wrong information or advice, accessibility to self-medication, fear
300 of HIV status exposure at the facility. The solutions to these problems as enumerated included
301 community mobilization on SMWA, improvement of the management of the local health

302 facilities and the attitude of the health personnel towards efficient and effective service and
303 strengthening of the community health strategy.

304

305 **Structural modification**

306 The study established that the main barrier to the community mobilization on SMWA was the
307 community perception of their local health facility services which was poor services. They
308 highlighted the poor attitude of the health personnel towards efficient and effective service,
309 inadequate examination equipment, limited types of drugs for the treatment of malaria and other
310 infections and they hoped for 24 hour system of operation. They also hoped that HIV screening
311 be made voluntary, counseling services be put in place and that health education services be
312 provided at the facility. This called for mitigating for the barriers or structural intervention. A
313 feedback report was given to the local health facility management representatives. The
314 management representatives did not take up these comments positively and blamed the CHVs for
315 misinforming the public. This called for redirecting efforts to activities that may be more
316 effective. A conflict management meeting was then organized by the researcher, the CHEW for
317 the Nyalenda B CHVs and the health management representatives. The CHVs encouraged
318 themselves to continue with the household health promotion and especially community
319 mobilization on self-medication with antimicrobials. A 5-monthly Integrated Health Outreach
320 Services (IHOS) within Nyalenda B was planned for and implemented to fill in the gap for the
321 community perception of poor health service at their local facility and to mitigate for time factor
322 and distance. The IHOS reached a total of 575 people of which 154 were children below 5 years.

323

324 **Training outcome for CHVs and all the 1531 PLA trainees**

325 The percentage frequency of 'YES' in the CHV group for participatory interaction is 96.4%,
326 Participatory evaluation is 92.4%, Flexible learning and listening is at 95.3%, power within is
327 83.5%, power with is 71.8%, power over is at 55.6% hence the level of PLA and Empowerment
328 achieved for every domain. The percentage frequency of 'YES' in the 1531 PLA trained group
329 for participatory interaction is 100%, Participatory evaluation is 96% Flexible learning and
330 listening is 96%, power within is 96%, power with is 94%, power over is 88% hence the level of
331 PLA and Empowerment achieved for every domain. The percentage frequency for power over is
332 comparatively low. The percentage frequency of power over components reveals that, even after

333 the PLA training, 20.4% of the trainees did not develop the ability to influence and coerce the
334 health facility to serve them efficiently, 34.6% were not aware that they were represented at the
335 Health Facility Management Board, 51.4% did not understand how community health strategy
336 operates, 23.9% did not know how to access their health rights, opportunities and services but
337 85.3% were positive that they can access their health rights, opportunity and services through
338 the health facility. Therefore, to realize better power over results the community health strategy
339 should be strengthened.

340 **The association between PLA domains and all empowerment domains for all the 1531 PLA** 341 **trainees**

342 In order to establish the association between PLA domains and all empowerment domains, the
343 Odd Ratios, 95% CI and p-values were obtained using binary logistic regression. The results
344 shows that flexible learning and listening may increase power within by 5 times (OR=5.361,
345 95% CI=3.101-9.268 $P<0.0001$), power with by 6 times (OR=6.160, 95% CI=3.437-11.039,
346 $P<0.0001$) and power over by 2 times (OR=2.261, 95% CI=1.293-3.954. $P<0.0001$),
347 Participatory evaluation may increase power within by almost 8 times (OR=7.711, 95%
348 CI=5.184-11.459, $P<0.0001$), power with by 5 times (OR=5.012, 95% CI=3.375-7.443,
349 $P<0.0001$), power over by more than 3 and a half times (OR=3.618, 95% CI=2,375-5,509,
350 $P<0.0001$), Participatory interaction may increase power within by almost 8 times (OR=7.823,
351 95% CI=4.798-12.763, $P<0.0001$), power with by 8 and a half times (OR=8.610, 95% CI=
352 4.987-14.866 $P<0.0001$), power over by 4 times (OR=4.003, 95% CI=2.325-6.693, $P<0.0001$).
353 (Table 2).

354 The strength of association between all the PLA domains and power over is relatively lower as
355 compared to other domains of empowerment

356

357 **DISCUSSION**

358 In this study, our use of a PLA approach and methodology enabled community health volunteers
359 and the household representatives to engage meaningfully and contribute to the identification of
360 self-medication with antimicrobials' root causes and control measures. In the process, they were
361 also empowered with the tools for exercising personal control over their health habits (Bandura,
362 1994). The PLA, if well-facilitated can have an integrating function that prompts broader social

363 connections and enables empowerment. A pilot study in Kisumu a city in Kenya explored the
364 utility and effectiveness of participatory action research as an approach for youth-led peace
365 building in marginalized communities and proved it a valuable methodological approach. It
366 enabled quick learning of skills, direct uptake of systematic challenges and use of minimum
367 resources on implementation (Amambia et al., 2018). PLA initiatives based on strengthening self
368 reliance and sustainability and undertaken in the Little Karoo, South Africa and Odibo, Namibia,
369 as well as in various communities in Zambia, and on numerous RDP capacity-building training
370 initiatives in the Northern Cape Province. South Africa proved to be appropriate strategy for
371 development(Wetmore & Theron, 1998). Three key elements that distinguished our approach
372 from the conventional health education is, flexible learning and listening, participatory
373 evaluation, and participatory interaction.

374 Our key finding regarding access to the community is that expanding the research team to
375 include and train CHVs in PLA made it possible to involve the households in a meaningful
376 participation and to generate a wider sample. The CHVs and the households relate well,
377 understand and respect each other, thus further pointing out that peer researchers are an essential
378 bridge for better results. The trained community peer life circumstances and characteristics
379 closely resembled those of the target population thereby giving them a higher opportunity of
380 influencing acceptance of health messages (Janz et al., 1996). The findings of the current study
381 are consistent with those of another one in which a cluster-randomized controlled trial in Nepal
382 showed an effect of a participatory intervention with women's groups on birth outcomes (Dama,
383 2004) The intervention in that study worked very well with peer researchers leading to
384 improved birth outcomes through a low cost, potentially sustainable and scalable, participatory
385 intervention. A systematic review of 24 studies that was aimed at examining the magnitude of
386 the impact of community engagement (CE) on health and health inequalities among
387 disadvantaged populations showed that one of the factors that facilitated CE was PLA and one of
388 the elements of the programme success was the incorporation of the cultural competent CHWs in
389 the research protocol. These studies were distributed into different areas of which 17 were
390 conducted in the United States, and there was one each in Canada, Bangladesh, Africa, China,
391 the United Kingdom, Iran, and India (Cyril, J.Smith, Possamai-Inesedy, & Renzaho, 2015)

392

393 Our key finding regarding self-medication empowerment is that a PLA methodology enabled
394 increment of all domains of empowerment on the part of CHVs and the community throughout
395 the process of the research activities. All domains of PLA were achieved at very high level and
396 this is also true for empowerment except for power-over which was achieved but at
397 comparatively lower level. The association between PLA domains and all empowerment
398 domains is very strong but the strength of association between all the PLA domains and power
399 over is relatively lower as compared to other domains of empowerment. A study on the Impact
400 of Participatory Learning and Action Women's Groups Alone or Combined with Cash and Food
401 Transfers on Maternal Agency in Rural Nepal (Lu Gram, 2018) ruled out larger impacts for PLA
402 alone, comparable in size to the impact observed in the PLA and cash arm on improvement of
403 maternal agency (power-over). It has also been recognized that community mobilization
404 strategies must be complemented by structural interventions to bring about comprehensive
405 changes in the social, economic, legal and political structures that led to disempowerment in the
406 first place (Asthana & Oostvogels, 1996; Kerrigan, 2003). This is supported by the previous
407 theoretical views (Kabeer, 2003; Sen, 1999) which emphasize moving beyond empowerment for
408 the individual, to welfare enhancement for achieving lasting social transformation.

409 **CONCLUSION**

410 The PLA enabled the community to alter their perspectives as a result of learning from others.
411 Such major shifts in perspective are not readily made, but this is where PLA comes into its own,
412 managing divergent experiences and potentially divisive views. Participation is typically an
413 adjunct to implementation rather than as a primary intervention. In the transparent, democratic,
414 and dialogic PLA environment, the community may gain an entirely new perspective which
415 prompts them to shift position from long-held patterns of belief or behavior.

416 The PLA enabled the community to work out a guideline for control of self-medication with
417 antimicrobials which is suitable for them. Another key strength of this study was the
418 commitment and the CHVs motivated as co-researchers. The PLA training is not limited to use
419 in a single research project; once trained, peer researchers can apply PLA to any primary
420 healthcare research topic. Ultimately, this builds the capacity of communities to engage in
421 rigorous participatory research. The PLA, if well-facilitated, can have an integrating function
422 that prompts broader social connections and enables empowerment at a low cost.

423

424 Reference:

425

426 Amambia, S. C., Bivens, F., Hamisi, M., Lancaster, I., Ogada, O., Okumu, G. O., et al. (2018).
427 Participatory Action Research for Advancing Youth Led Peace Building in Kenya. In
428 *Peaceworks* (Vol. 142). Washington, DC 20037: United States Institute of Peace.

429 Asthana, S., & Oostvogels, R. (1996). Community participation in HIV prevention: problems
430 and prospects for community-based strategies among female sex workers in Madras. *Soc*
431 *Sci Med*, 43(2), 133-148.

432 Awad, A., Eltayeb, I., Matowe, L., & Thalib, L. (2005). Self-medication with antibiotics and
433 antimalarials in the community of Khartoum State, Sudan. *J Pharm Pharm Sci*, 8(2), 326-
434 331.

435 Bandura, A. (1994). Social cognitive theory and exercise of control over HIV infection. In
436 J. DiClemente, Peterson, J.L., eds. (Ed.), *Preventing AIDS: theories and methods of*
437 *behavioral interventions* (pp. 25-50). New York, : Plenum Press.

438 Belkina Tatyana, A. A. W., Elhassan Hussein Eltom, NigoraTadjieva, Ales Kubena, Jiri Vlcek.
439 (2014). Antibiotic use and knowledge in the community of Yemen, Saudi Arabia, and
440 Uzbekistan. *J Infect Dev Countr.*, 8 (4), 424 – 429.

441 Chambers, R. (1997). *Chambers, R. (1997). Whose reality counts (Vol. 25). London:*
442 *Intermediate technology publications.*

443 Cyril, S., J. Smith, B., Possamai-Inesedy, A., & Renzaho, A. M. N. (2015). Exploring the role of
444 community engagement in improving the health of disadvantaged populations: a
445 systematic review *Glob Health Action*, 8, 10-34.

446 Dama, M. (2004). Effect of a participatory intervention with women's groups on birth outcomes
447 in Nepal: cluster-randomised controlled trial *Lancet*, 364, 970-979.

448 Haswell, M. R., Kavanagh, D., Tsey, K. , Reilly, L. , Cadet-James, Y. , Laliberte, A. , Wilson,
449 A. , Doran, C. (2010). Psychometric validation of the Growth and Empowerment
450 Measure (GEM) applied with Indigenous Australians. *Aust NZ J Psychiat*, 44(9), 791-
451 799.

452 Hughes, C. M., McElnay, J. C., & Fleming, G. F. (2001). Benefits and risks of self medication.
453 *Drug Saf*, 24(14), 1027-1037.

454 Janz, N. K., Zimmerman, M. A., Wren, P. A., Israel, B. A., Freudenberg, N., & Carter, R. J.
455 (1996). Evaluation of 37 AIDS prevention projects: successful approaches and barriers to
456 program effectiveness. *Health Educ Q*, 23(1), 80-97.

- 457 Kabeer, N. (2003). Gender Equality, Poverty Eradication and the Millennium Development
458 Goals: Promoting Women's Capabilities and Participation. In *Women in Development*
459 *Discussion Paper Series* (pp. 1-26). Sussex: Institute of Development Studies.
- 460 Kerrigan, D., Ellen, J., Moreno, L. (2003). Environmental structural factors significantly
461 associated with consistent condom use among female sex workers in the Dominican
462 Republic. *AIDS*, 17, 415–423.
- 463 KIHBS. (2005/06). *Kenya Integrated Household Budget Survey (2005/06)(Revised Edition)*
464 *Kenyan-Population-and-Housing-Census 3rd January 2012*. Retrieved. from.
- 465 Lu Gram, J. M., Naomi Saville, Shyam Sundar Yadav, Bhim Shrestha, Dharma Manandhar,
466 Anthony Costello & Jolene Skordis-Worrall. (2018). Do Participatory Learning and
467 Action Women's Groups Alone or Combined with Cash or Food Transfers Expand
468 Women's Agency in Rural Nepal? *JDS*(DOI: 10.1080/00220388.2018.1448069).
- 469 Manandhar, M. (1996). An exploratory study of local health committees in Nepal. In. London:
470 Centre for International Child Health, Institute of Child Health.
- 471 **Melzack, R. (1973). The puzzle of pain (Vol. 5022). New York: Basic Books.**
- 472 Montastruc, J. L., Bagheri, H., Geraud, T., & Lapeyre-Mestre, M. (1997). [Pharmacovigilance of
473 self-medication]. *Therapie*, 52(2), 105-110.
- 474 Mukherjee, N. (2001). Participatory Learning and Action, with 100 Field Methods. In. New
475 Delhi.
- 476 Nasir, T. W., Dargicho, A., Mulugeta, T. A. (2012). Self-Medication with
477 Antibiotics and Antimalarials in the Community of Silte Zone, South Ethiopia. *TAF*
478 *Preven Med Bull*, 11(5), 529-536.
- 479 O'Reilly-de Brún, M., Tomas de Brún, Ekaterina Okonkwo, Jean-Samuel Bonsenge-
480 Bokanga, Maria Manuela De Almeida Silva, Florence Ogbemor, Aga Mierzejewska,
481 Lovina Nnadi, Evelyn van Weel-Baumgarten, Chris van Weel, Maria van den
482 Muijsenbergh, and Anne MacFarlane. (2016). Using Participatory Learning & Action
483 research to access and engage with 'hard to reach' migrants in primary healthcare
484 research. *BMC Health Serv Res*, 16(25).
- 485 Ocan, M., Bwanga, F., Bbosa, G. S., Bagenda, D., Waako, P., Ogwal-Okeng, J., et al. (2014).
486 Patterns and predictors of self-medication in northern Uganda. *PLoS One*, 9(3), e92323.
- 487 Okeke, I. N., Laxminarayan, R., Bhutta, Z. A., Duse, A. G., Jenkins, P., O'Brien, T. F., et al.
488 (2005). Antimicrobial resistance in developing countries. Part I: recent trends and current
489 status. *Lancet Infect Dis*, 5(8), 481-493.

- 490 Owour, I. A., Alwar, J., Oyugi, H., . (2015). Perceptions influencing self medication with
491 antibiotics and/or antimalarials. *AJPHR*, 3(3), 116-121.
- 492 Rifkin, S., Muller, F., Bichmann, W. (1988). Primary health care: on measuring participation. *Soc*
493 *Sci Med*, 26, 931-940.
- 494 Rowlands, J. (1997). Questioning Empowerment: Working with Women in Honduras. In.
495 Oxford, UK: Oxfam.
- 496 Sen, A. (1999). Women's Agency and Social Change in Development as Freedom. In (pp. 188-
497 203). New York: Anchor Books.
- 498 Sepehri, A. P., J. (1996). Primary health care, community participation and community-
499 financing: experiences of two middle
500 hill villages in Nepal. *Health Policy Plan*, 11, 93-100.
- 501 Susan, B., Rifkin. (1986). Lessons from community participation in health programmes. *Health*
502 *Policy Plan*, 1, 240-249.
- 503 Susan, B., Rifkin. (2001). *Partners in Planning: Information, Participation and Empowerment.*,
- 504 Thomas, T., Pradeep Narayanan, Tisha Wheeler, Usha Kiran, M J Joseph, T V Ramanathan
505 (2011). Design of a Community Ownership and Preparedness Index: using data to inform
506 the capacity development of community-based groups. *J Epidemiol Community Health*,
507 66(2).
- 508 Kirrane, C., Sharkey, C., & Naess, L. O. (2013). Shaping strategies: factors and actors in climate
509 change adaptation-Lessons from two-year case studies in Africa and Latin America.
510 Trócaire and the Institute of Development Studies. Tyler, R. (1974). *Basic Principles of*
511 *Curriculum and instruction*. University of Chicago press. Chicago, IL, USA.
- 512 Vassall, A., Chandrashekar, S., Pickles, M., Beattie, T. S., Shetty, G., Bhattacharjee, P., et al.
513 (2014). Community mobilisation and empowerment interventions as part of HIV
514 prevention for female sex workers in Southern India: a cost-effectiveness analysis. *PLoS*
515 *One*, 9(10), e110562.
- 516 Wetmore, S. B., & Theron, F. (1998). Community development and research: Participatory
517 learning and action -a development strategy in itself. *Journal of development Southern*
518 *Africa* 15(1).
- 519 WHO. (2000). *Guidelines for the regulatory assessment of medicinal products for use in self-*
520 *medication*.

521 WHO. (2001). Global strategy for Containment of Antimicrobial Resistance: World Health
522 Organization, Communicable Disease surveillance and Response In (Vol. (CSR).WHO /
523 CDS / CSR / DRS / 2001).

524

525

526

527

528

529

530

531

532

533

534

535

536

537

538

539

540

541

542

543

544

545

UNDER PEER REVIEW

546 **Table 1: Socio-demographic characteristics of 1531 people (household representatives [hhr] and CHVs) SMWA PLA trained**
 547 **by all empowerment domains**

| Socio demographic characteristics | Power within | | P value | Power with | | P value | Power over | | P value |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------|-----------|---------|--------------------|-----------|---------|--------------------|-----------|---------|
| | Yes | No | | Yes | No | | Yes | No | |
| Age | | | 0.603 | | | 0.008 | | | 0.029 |
| 15-25 | 367(85.3) | 63(14.7) | | 293(68.1) | 137(31.9) | | 262(60.9) | 168(39.1) | |
| 26-35 | 600(83.1) 46.9* | 122(16.9) | | 531(73.5) 48.3* | 191(26.5) | | 398(55.1) 46.7* | 324(44.9) | |
| 36-50 | 247(82.9) | 51(17.1) | | 227(76.2) | 71(23.8) | | 153(51.3) | 145(48.7) | |
| above 50 | 65(80.2) | 16(19.8) | | 49(60.5) | 32(39.5) | | 39(48.1) | 42(51.9) | |
| Gender | | | | | | | | | |
| Male | 268(77.2) | 79(22.8) | <0.0001 | 251(72.3) | 96(27.7) | 0.816 | 195(56.2) | 152(43.8) | 0.816 |
| Female | 1011(85.4) | 173(14.6) | | 849(71.7) | 335(28.3) | | 657(55.5) | 527(44.5) | |
| Marital status | | | | | | | | | |
| Single | 286(84.1) | 54(15.9) | 0.072 | 241(70.9) | 99(29.1) | 0.121 | 198(58.2) | 142(41.8) | 0.134 |
| Married | 876(82.5) 79.0* | 186(17.5) | | 766(72.1) 77.2* | 296(27.9) | | 576(54.2) 77.2* | 486(45.8) | |
| Divorced | 18(100.0) | 0(0.0) | | 12(66.7) | 6(33.3) | | 13(72.2) | 5(27.8) | |
| Widowed | 77(91.7) | 7(8.3) | | 56(66.7) | 28(33.3) | | 53(63.1) | 31(36.9) | |
| Separated | 22(81.5) | 5(18.5) | | 25(92.6) | 2(7.4) | | 12(44.4) | 15(55.6) | |
| Family status | | | | | | | | | |
| Father | 252(80.0) | 63(20.0) | 0.002 | 233(74.0) | 82(26.0) | <0.0001 | 174(55.2) | 141(44.8) | <0.0001 |
| Mother | 881(86.0) 68.9* | 144(14.0) | | 750(73.2) 68.2* | 275(26.8) | | 599(58.4) 70.3* | 426(41.6) | |
| Son or Doughier | 70(78.7) | 19(21.3) | | 62(69.7) | 27(30.3) | | 38(42.7) | 51(57.3) | |
| Others | 76(74.5) | 26(25.5) | | 55(53.9) | 47(46.1) | | 41(40.2) | 61(59.8) | |
| Educational level | | | | | | | | | |
| Illiterate | 74(81.3) | 17(18.7) | 0.025 | 63(69.2) | 28(30.8) | <0.0001 | 65(71.4) | 26(28.6) | <0.0001 |
| Read and write only | 130(90.3) | 14(9.7) | | 127(88.2) | 17(11.8) | | 108(75.0) | 36(25.0) | |
| Primary school | 304(81.3) | 70(18.7) | | 278(74.3) | 96(25.7) | | 202(54.0) | 172(46.0) | |
| Secondary school | 448(81.5) 35.0* | 102(18.5) | | 376(68.4) 34.2* | 174(31.6) | | 291(52.9) 34.2* | 259(47.1) | |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|--|--------------------|-----------|-------|--------------------|-----------|---------|--------------------|-----------|--------|
| College level | 323(86.8) | 49(13.2) | | 256(68.8) | 116(31.2) | | 186(50.0) | 186(50.0) | |
| Occupation | | | | | | | | | |
| Student | 101(82.1) | 22(17.9) | 0.392 | 96(78.0) | 27(22.0) | 0.002 | 71(57.7) | 52(42.3) | 0.071 |
| Government employee | 68(87.2) | 10(12.8) | | 56(71.8) | 22(28.2) | | 54(69.2) | 24(30.8) | |
| self employed | 651(84.9) 50.9* | 116(15.1) | | 577(75.2) 52.5* | 190(24.8) | | 432(56.3) 50.9* | 335(43.7) | |
| Employed by a private business | 107(83.6) | 211(6.4) | | 87(68.0) | 413(2.0) | | 66(51.6) | 62(48.4) | |
| Unemployed | 352(80.9) | 83(19.1) | | 284(65.3) | 151(34.7) | | 229(52.6) | 206(47.4) | |
| Average monthly income | | | | | | | | | |
| less than 5,000 | 897(85.0) 70.1* | 158(15.0) | 0.065 | 770(73.0) 70.0* | 285(27.0) | 0.020 | 586(55.5) 68.8* | 469(44.5) | 0.868 |
| 5000 to 10, 000 | 264(80.0) | 66(20.0) | | 218(66.1) | 112(33.9) | | 187(56.7) | 143(43.3) | |
| > 10, 000 | 118(80.8) | 28(19.2) | | 112(76.7) | 34(23.3) | | 79(54.1) | 67(45.9) | |
| Approximate drug expenditure | | | | | | | | | |
| < 500 | 827(82.0) 64.7* | 182(18.0) | 0.008 | 745(73.8) 67.7* | 264(26.2) | 0.025 | 548(54.3) 64.3* | 461(45.7) | 0.183 |
| 500 to 1, 000 | 193(82.8) | 40(17.2) | | 165(70.8) | 68(29.2) | | 142(60.9) | 91(39.1) | |
| > 1, 000 | 259(89.6) | 30(10.4) | | 190(65.7) | 99(34.3) | | 162(56.1) | 127(43.9) | |
| Religion | | | | | | | | | |
| Christian Orthodox | 180(83.7) | 35(16.3) | 0.056 | 161(74.9) | 54(25.1) | 0.063 | 156(72.6) | 59(27.4) | <0.001 |
| Christian protestant | 640(86.1) 50.0* | 103(40.9) | | 517(69.6) 47.0* | 226(30.4) | | 374(50.3) 43.9* | 369(49.7) | |
| Muslim | 27(77.1) | 8(22.9) | | 23(65.7) | 12(34.3) | | 21(60.0) | 14(40.0) | |
| Christian catholic | 378(79.9) | 95(20.1) | | 344(72.7) | 129(27.3) | | 254(53.7) | 219(46.3) | |
| Others | 54(83.1) | 11(16.9) | | 55(84.6) | 10(15.4) | | 47(72.3) | 18(27.7) | |
| Health condition of the drug consumer | | | | | | | | | |
| Pregnant | 8688.7 | 1111.3 | 0.018 | 81(83.5) | 16(16.5) | <0.0001 | 62(63.9) | 35(36.1) | 0.007 |
| Breast feeding | 154(78.2) | 43(21.8) | | 139(70.6) | 58(29.4) | | 107(54.3) | 90(45.7) | |
| Has a chronic disease | 77(77.8) | 22(22.2) | | 59(59.6) | 40(40.4) | | 56(56.6) | 43(43.4) | |
| Child under 12 | 482(86.2) | 77(13.8) | | 423(75.7) | 136(24.3) | | 334(59.7) | 225(40.3) | |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|-----------|--------|--|-----------|-----------|--|-----------|-----------|--|
| years | 37.7* | | | 38.5* | | | 39.2* | | |
| 13 -59 years | 440(82.2) | 9517.8 | | 361(67.5) | 174(32.5) | | 265(49.5) | 270(50.5) | |
| > 59 years | 40(90.9) | 4(9.1) | | 37(84.1) | 7(15.9) | | 28(63.6) | 16(36.4) | |

UNDER PEER REVIEW

548

549

550 NOTE: **1:** Values in bracket (), are % socio-demographic characteristic within a specified
551 category. **2:** Values with * are % socio-demographic characteristic within a specified category
552 of empowerment.

553 **Table 2: The association between PLA domains and all empowerment domains as outcome**
554 **variables for 1531 SMWA PLA trainees in Nyalenda B Ward**

| | Power within | | | Power with | | | Power over | | |
|--|--------------|-------|--------------|------------|-------|--------------|------------|-------|-------------|
| | P | OR | 95%CI | P | OR | 95%CI | P | OR | 95%CI |
| Flexible learning and listening | <0.0001 | 5.361 | 3.101-9.268 | <0.0001 | 6.160 | 3.437-11.039 | <0.0001 | 2.261 | 1.293-3.954 |
| Participatory evaluation | <0.0001 | 7.711 | 5.184-11.459 | <0.0001 | 5.012 | 3.375-7.443 | <0.0001 | 3.618 | 2,375-5,509 |
| Participatory interaction | <0.0001 | 7.823 | 4.798-12.763 | <0.0001 | 8.610 | 4.987-14.866 | <0.0001 | 4.003 | 2.325-6.693 |

555

556

557