



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Asian Journal of Research in Agriculture and Forestry</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRAF_46963
Title of the Manuscript:	The riparian tree species composition and diversity of the midstream of Halda river in Chittagong, Bangladesh
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<p><b>2. Materials and Methods</b></p> <p><b>2.1 Description of the Study Area</b></p> <p>Lines 96-105: The Information provided as a description of the study area does not correspond to this section. This information was already reported in the introduction. Description of the study area lacks corresponding to geographic coordinates, climate data, soil information and the characterization of vegetation.</p> <p><b>2.2 Sampling methods</b></p> <p>In the sampling method, not indicate the total number of quadrants (400 m<sup>2</sup> each) sampled or surface in m<sup>2</sup> sampled. It is important to mention the minimum sampling area.</p> <p><b>2.3 Data analysis</b></p> <p>Line 124: Chaturvedi and Khanna, 1982 had not been reported in the references.</p> <p>Line 143: Change "according to (Curtis, 1959)" to "according to Curtis, 1959" ...</p> <p>Line 143: Curtis, (1959) was not reported in the references.</p> <p>Line 143: Change "(Dhaulkhanda et al 2008) and (Whittaker &amp; Feeny 1971)" to (Dhaulkhanda et al 2008; &amp; Feeny Whittaker 1971).</p> <p>Line 205: Menhinick (1964) cites was not reported in the references.</p> <p><b>3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS</b></p> <p><b>3.1 Tree species composition</b></p> <p>Line 218: Change (Table 1 and Table 2) to (Tables 1 and 2).</p> <p>Line 218: the results of tree species composition (including Tables 1 and 2 were omitted)</p>	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<p>are not reported in the text.</p> <p><b>3.2 Diversity Indices</b></p> <p>Lines 230-233: Delete the following paragraph:</p> <p>"Different diversity indices, ie Shannon-Wiener Diversity Index (H), Margalef 's richness index (R), Simpon's Dominance Index (D), Pielou's Species evenness index (E) and Menhinick's richness index (DI) Were Calculated to depict tree species diversity of the study área". This paragraph has been repeated the methodology.</p> <p>Lines 233, 260, 268, 282: the inclusion of the following tables in the text were omitted: a) Table 3 (results on diversity indices); b) Table 4 (Importance Value Index of Riparian Halda tree species); c) Table 5 (on Structural composition height classes); d) Table 6 (on Structural composition of tree species based on diameter class distribution).</p> <p>Line 238: Change ; to .</p> <p>Line 261: Change "From the value of IVI, Possessing the higher" to "The higher IVI Possessing ..."</p> <p>It is advisable to mention the names of the authors of plant species when presented for the first time.</p> <p>Line 266: "based on height Structural composition classes" was not reported in the methodology.</p> <p><b>4. Conclusions</b></p> <p>The mancript does not present any conclusions about the floristic diversity of the study area. Not properly conclude the information on the structure of vegetation.</p> <p>In summary, the manuscript omitted the presentation of results (Tables 2-6) on the structure and floristic composition of vegetation, therefore, under the current scheme is not recommended for publication.</p>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p>	<p><b>ABSTRACT</b></p> <p>Lines 7 &amp; 114: Change (20 mx 20 m) to (20 x 20 m).</p> <p>The abstract lacks a short metodology where indicates the recording of variables and techniques applied for the determination of diversity.</p> <p>Mentioning the corresponding outstanding results-Wienners Shannon Diversity Index, Simpson's Dominance Index, Index Pielou's Species evenness, Margalef's and Menhinick's richness index.</p> <p>Indicate the results of the importance Value Index of species.</p> <p>Line 54: Change Van et al. (2004) to Van De Wiel &amp; Darby (2004).</p> <p>Line 56: The reference of Cerqueira et al. (2014) is not reported in the Bibliography (References).</p>	



**INTRODUCTION**

Line 37: place these coordinates (22 ° 28'56.09 "N & 91 ° 54'07.62" E), in the study area.  
Lines 46 & 50: The reference (Dey, 2017) is not reported in the Bibliography (references).  
Line 52: Wiel and Darby (2004) are not reported in the references.  
Line 61: change (Akhter 2015) to (Akhter, 2015).  
Line 65: Ferdous (2015), was not reported in the references.  
Line 70; Delete (Zaman 2014), repeated information.

It is noteworthy that almost all of the introduction provides information on: a) the location, property and structure of the Halda River; b) Information on different man made activities Industrial Such as discharge, I tobacco farming, rubber dam construction, brick-field construction; however, it does not provide sufficient information on the structure, composition and diversity of vegetation study area.

**REFERENCES**

Line 352: Hitzhusen, et al. (2007). Add the names of collaborators.  
Lines 359-361: Specify the initial name Kibria, ... (2017).  
Changing the title reference to lowercase.  
Lines: 327-329: Change the title of the reference letter case.  
Line 386: Add the number of pages.  
The following references were not mentioned in the text:  
Bikash Dey, A. (2017, February 4). Halda in peril. *The Daily Star*. Retrieved from <https://www.thedailystar.net/city/halda-peril-1355791>  
Facchini Cerqueira, MR, Pinto, MF, Derossi, IN, Esteves, WT, Rachid Santos, MD, Costa Matos, MA ... Matos, RC (2014). Chemical Characteristics of rainwater at a site of southeastern Brazil. *Atmospheric Pollution Research*, 5 (2), 253-261. <https://doi.org/10.5094/APR.2014.031>  
Jannatul Ferdous, M., Rashidul Karim, M., Hossain, M., Arifur Rahman, M., & Iqbal, M. (2015). *Fin fish assemblages and biodiversity status of carps on Halda River, Bangladesh* (Vol. 02).  
Williams, GM (1991). *Techniques and fieldwork in ecology*. Collinseducational.  
[www.haldariver.org](http://www.haldariver.org) . (2018). Retrieved May 13, 2018, from <http://www.haldariver.org/about%20halda.html>



SDI Review Form 1.6

<b>Optional/General</b> comments		
----------------------------------	--	--

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Rahim Foroughbakhch</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>University of Nuevo Leon, Mexico</b>